

## The Effect of Human Trafficking on Human Security in the Oromia Regional State of Ethiopia

\* Befekadu Zeleke (Ph.D. & Assoc. Prof)

Department of Educational Planning and Management

Addis Ababa University

Email: [befekaduzk@gmail.com](mailto:befekaduzk@gmail.com) or [befekadu.zeleke@aau.edu.et](mailto:befekadu.zeleke@aau.edu.et)

\*\* Fozia Amin

Institute of Peace and Security Studies

Addis Ababa University

Email: [Fozia.amin@gmail.com](mailto:Fozia.amin@gmail.com)

### Abstract

*Human trafficking endangers human security from the origin countries up to destinations. This study was aimed at exploring the effect of human trafficking on human security. A descriptive survey design was employed to explore and describe the effects of human trafficking in light of human security. The qualitative data were collected from four Zones of Oromia Region and analyzed through thematic analysis. Finally, the results unveiled that migrants in their movement were exposed to numerous human security problems in the desert, sea journey as well as in their destination countries including gross violation of human rights, inhuman treatment, sexual harassment, thirsty, hunger, physical violence, and health problems. The study further disclosed that the problem is beyond the government's capacity due to multiple actors' involvement intertwined with poverty and unemployment opportunities in the study area. The study concludes that since human trafficking transcends state boundaries, it would be difficult to overcome the problem through sporadic efforts by individual countries or nations. Hence, there is a need for concerted efforts to be put in place by governments, national and international organizations to solve the problem of human trafficking.*

**Key Words:** Migration, Trafficking, Human Trafficking, Smugglers, Human Security

## 1.1. Background

Human trafficking is a worldwide crime. It is enormously contemporary throughout the world and affects millions of people every year (Marinova and James, 2012; ILO; 2014; Petit, 2014). Human trafficking transcends state boundaries, constitutes a major challenge to the world, and comprehends many diverse forms of exploitation. It is an issue with domestic and international components (Marinova et.al., 2012). It also ranks as the third biggest crime alongside drug trafficking and the illegal arms trade (Bahar, 2014). As an international crime, it has been and continues to be persistent with an increasing trend since the ancient African slave trade era to contemporary modern society (ILO, 2008).

Despite its long history, attention has been given by the international community since 1990 to collectively stand to control and combat it. Over recent years, many states have stepped up efforts against human trafficking (Friesendorf, 2009). Countries both in their domestic legislation and through international laws have attempted to develop a legal and institutional framework in response to the increasing problem. The scheme of legal frameworks at the international level ranges from dynamic trafficking-specific legislation such as the 2000 Trafficking Protocol to a more general and human rights-focused legal instruments. Besides 2000 Protocol to prevent, suppress and punish trafficking in persons, supplementing the United Nations Convention against Transnational Organized Crime, legal instruments prohibiting slavery, forced labor, child labor, rights of migrant workers and persons with disabilities, as well as more general treaties dealing with civil, cultural, economic, political or social rights, all encompass provisions dealing with human trafficking (UNHCR, 2014). However, despite the robust commitments' states have entered in to through human rights treaties and other trafficking-specific obligations, little progress has been made in terms of combating the ever-increasing trend of trafficked persons especially in Africa. Studies and Countries' human trafficking reports show that the extent and magnitude of human trafficking have been escalating dramatically (ILO, 2008).

At the European Union level as well, the European Commission has suggested a comprehensive and integrated approach, which respects human rights, appropriately to address the trafficking of human beings. However, their approach is not applied sufficiently. Instead, the human rights of victims—such as protection and assistance—are underemphasized, while criminalization and prosecution of human traffickers get a lot of emphases (IOM, 2008). For instance, these days, European countries are very worried about the current migration crisis, with large numbers of people, mainly from Africa, the Middle East, and South Asia being on the move and seeking to establish a new home in Europe. The European Union recently took

the position that the present approach of strengthening tight border restriction rather than the protection of the migrants cannot halt the influx of migrants (Estevens,2018).

At the expense of the life and dignity of millions of people, human trafficking nowadays is getting to be a lucrative industry involving several actors to sustain the business (Peulić, 2017). As human trafficking is illicit, throughout the process of transporting persons from home to place and/or country of destination, not only it breaches criminal laws of countries including public international law but also results in grave human rights violations (OHCHR, 2002). Human trafficking, in particular, puts such human rights as the right to freedom of movement, the security of persons, equality, and dignity of trafficked persons at stake, and subsequently, presents an imminent threat to human security.

In Africa, hundreds of thousands of people are being trafficked both within and outside the continent and forced into situations of labor and sexual exploitation. Traffickers recruit people from impoverished African regions and sell them out for exploitation with virtually no risk of being prosecuted (IOM, 2009).

According to ILO (2017), there are more than 40 million victims of human trafficking worldwide and the vast majority of the victims happen to be women and children. A large number of women and children suffer from different types of inhuman abuses and exploitation because of human trafficking. Sub-Saharan Africa, being the poorest region in the world, is the most vulnerable region from which a substantial number of victims have been recruited for both continental and intercontinental transaction (ILO, 2010). This also holds for Ethiopian men, women, and children who have been immensely leaving the country via various channels within assorted trafficking networks.

## **1.2. Review of the Literature**

### **Causes and Consequences of Human Trafficking**

Different commentators in the field of human trafficking (Camwerron and New Man,2008; UNODC 2009, and UNODC,2008) suggest that an understanding of human trafficking requires an analysis of the operation of, and interaction between, a range of factors that combine to make individuals vulnerable to trafficking. To understand human trafficking in its broad social, economic and political contexts, it is important first to identify and know the interaction between such structural factors or variables of trafficking as economic deprivations, social inequality, and demand for the inexpensive labor force and adjacent factors of trafficking like loose national and international legal regimes, poor law enforcement, corruption, and weak education campaigns. This means identifying and knowing the interaction between the push and pull factors will help us in understanding the nature of human trafficking (Camwerron and New Man,2008).

Trafficking is a crime against the human being and against State security that has both long and short-term effects on the victim and State institutions. A victim will suffer from both physical and psychological harm. Even if eventually rescued, the trauma suffered by victims of trafficking is long-lasting and may never fully disperse (UNIDOC, 2011). Victims of trafficking generally work in sub-standard conditions, under increased risk of injuries or death while on the job, due to unregulated and unsafe working conditions or due to lack of proper health care. What makes the problem complex is traffickers use a range of coercive techniques to control their victims throughout the process of trafficking (Animaw, 2011). This is exercised by using a wide range of coercive control mechanisms, including debt bondage; isolation through the removal of identity and travel documents, isolation through prohibition to communicate with family members, friends, and people coming from the same area or country, locking inside the home, use of violence and fear, and the threat of reprisals against victims' families (IOM, 2006).

From the first phase of the trafficking process, the victim may suffer serious violations of their human rights, as recruitment mostly occurs in a situation where the victim is forced, deceived, and misguided. During transportation and upon arrival at the destination, the victims may repetitively be physically, sexually, and psychologically abused (Animaw, 2011). In a deliberate act of keeping them under control and in a submissive position, traffickers and/or employers appropriate their passport and render them undocumented. In such circumstances, the victims will usually be trapped in a condition where they cannot even seek help from authorities whenever they know where to go for assistance. If they end up deported or have to return to their communities, they may be stigmatized for what they have been forced to do (Animaw, 2011).

In Ethiopia, there are grave concerns that migration is endangering the present and future wellbeing of its young people. The migration industry also has many negative effects, which include, among others, smuggling and human trafficking. Due to the complex problems, Ethiopians have been exposed to migration dynamics, which is related to the history of the country. It has been fueled by various political, socio-economy, and environmental factors. Most of the migrants use irregular migration channels and trafficked to different countries (Nicola, 2014).

Ethiopia is a source country for people subjected to trafficking in persons, specifically conditions of forced labor and forced prostitution. Women from Ethiopia's rural areas are forced into domestic servitude and, less frequently, commercial sexual exploitation while boys are subjected to forced labor in traditional weaving, agriculture, herding, and street vending. Small numbers of Ethiopian girls are forced into domestic servitude outside of Ethiopia, primarily in Djibouti and Sudan, while Ethiopian boys are subjected to forced labor in Djibouti as shop assistants and chore boys. Women from all parts of Ethiopia are subjected to involuntary domestic servitude throughout the Middle East and in Sudan, and many transit Djibouti, Egypt, Libya, Somalia, or Yemen as they migrate to labor destinations. Ethiopian

women in the Middle East face severe abuses, including physical and sexual assault, denial of salary, sleep deprivation, confinement, incarceration, and murder. Many are driven to despair mental illness, and some commit suicide (Gebriel, 2011). On the other hand, in Ethiopia due to cultural attitude, it is seen as the natural provider of domestic services including cooking, cleaning, caretaking, and that increases the vulnerability of women to trafficking.

Oromia is one of the regional states where a large number of human trafficking is manifested. Human trafficking is one of the human security threats in the region especially, in East and West Hararge, Jimma, and West Arsi Zones where trafficked persons are subject to abuse, abduction, and extortion during their journey or at their final destination.

It is under this background that this study seeks to explore and unearth the effect of human trafficking on human security in the region in general and the target areas for the case study in particular and to suggest feasible recommendations to national and regional policymakers and other stakeholders for appropriate policy interventions.

### **1.3. Statement of the Problem**

From the ancient time of human civilization, human trafficking has been stayed for a long time (Malinowski, 2015). In this contemporary period, a globalized world almost no country is untouched by migration and its effects (Endalew, 2015).

Human trafficking has been and continues to be a threat to human security and the crime of international elements in most countries of the world. Ethiopia is no exception to this African ravaged problem and it is among the most affected countries in Africa. It is a country of both source and transit for men, women, and children who are vulnerable to forced labor and sex trafficking to the Middle East and Gulf States (USD, 2014, and IOM, 2008). Human trafficking has grown at a fast rate and has been creating an effect on the economy and social safety of society (MoFA, 2014). Most of the trafficked victims' families send their children to Arab countries at the pretext of better job opportunities and salary. These families finance the journey by borrowing money from financial institutions, their neighbors and relatives, and selling their properties (ILO, 2014).

Though the extent and magnitude of trafficking from Ethiopia have not yet been systematically documented, some official reports revealed that human trafficking has been alarmingly emerging as a serious national challenge. The widespread existence of trafficking is reinforced by poverty, unemployment due to low infrastructural development and false promises which leave many people with no perceived alternative than to migrate abroad for getting a job through traffickers or illegal employment agencies (Anteneh, 2011; Selamawit, 2013). According to the findings of the research done by the European Commission on victims of trafficking in Ethiopia, around 64% of participants traveled to the Middle East and the Gulf States seeking a job, 32% migrate seeking a better life and salary. A study carried out by the World Bank further indicated that in 2011 around 30% of the population of Ethiopia lived below the poverty line, and 31% lived on less than US\$1. 25 purchasing power parity a day

(World Bank 2015). Around 25% of Ethiopia's economically active population is only marginally involved in income-generating economic sectors (IMF, 2013).

What is awful in Ethiopia is the illegal nature of human trafficking and the assistance of family members and illegal private employment agencies. According to the United Nations, Crime and Justice Information Network, human trafficking in Ethiopia can be largely characterized by harboring people by cheating, intimidation, fraud, and other coercive mechanisms provoked by family members, local brokers, and/or illegal private employment agencies (Gudetu, 2014). This is particularly the case in Oromia regional state of Ethiopia. Human trafficking in the study area becomes a culture of habitual practice in which migrants' outflow by irregularly crossing borders in an organized way collectively either based on the assistance of family or relatives or singly with the help of smugglers and brokers. Sometimes irregular migration becomes a household decision rather than an individual decision.

The 2017 statistics on human trafficking show that the Oromia region is home for more than 2/3 (33.6%) of the entire trafficked persons in Ethiopia, and the vast majority of this figure happens to be from the four zones (Mehari, 2017). The inhabitants are irregularly migrating to a different corner of the world via overseas, oceans, and desert routes illegally, which has an impact on their security. It is a common belief that the young boys and girls have in their mind, migration as the only means of achieving a better life and widening choices. Now the youngsters are becoming indoctrinated of migration because of the prevalence and widespread migration in the area. Yet, there is a dearth of a study conducted to explore and document the effect of human trafficking in the region. Hence, the main purpose of this study is to explore the effect of human trafficking on human security in the region to fill in the existing research gap.

### **1.3.1. Research Questions**

1. What is the effect of human trafficking on human security in the study area?
  - 1.1. What is the effect of human trafficking on human security at the initial stage in the study area?
  - 1.2. What is the effect of human trafficking on human security during the journey in the study area?
  - 1.3. What is the effect of human trafficking on human security at the destination?

### **1.4. Scope of the Study**

This study is geographically delimited to Oromia regional state, the largest and one of the highly affected areas in human trafficking in Ethiopia. It is one of the nine regional states in Ethiopia. It is flanked by the Somali Region toward the East and Kenya toward the south. The 2007 Central Statistics Authority (CSA) projection shows that Oromia's population is



estimated to be more than 35 million, making it the biggest state in population and geographic coverage in Ethiopia.

### 1.5. Definition of Key Terms

**Trafficking** in persons refers to the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring, or receipt of persons, using the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or a position of vulnerability, or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over and her person, for exploitation (UN protocol, 2000 as cited in UNODC, 2008).

### 1.6. Research Methodology

#### 1.6.1. Research Design

A descriptive survey design of exploratory and explanatory was used to explore and/or comprehend how the communities in the study area feel, perceive, think and respond to the ever-growing trend of human trafficking and how devastating it is in human security terms. In descriptive exploratory designs, the study addresses ‘what questions’ of the research. In other words, ‘how’ questions are often addressed using an explanatory type of research. It also uses an exploratory research type to understand the subjective experience of the unit of analysis.

#### 1.6.2. Data Sources

Data for the study was collected from primary sources: police officials and prosecutors, legal experts, officials, other concerned government officials, and workers belonging to the public sectors working on anti-human trafficking activities in four Zones of Oromia Region. Besides, primary data were collected from victims, returnees, and the families of the victims, and concerned offices.

#### 1.6.3. Sampling

The principal research subjects of this study, inter alia, include government authorities at national, regional, zonal as well as woreda levels. The target research subjects of this study were composed of returnee migrants and returnee migrants’ parents, security and administration office, the police officers, and community elders. Particular emphasis was given to law enforcement bodies, and social workers working with migration. Thus, for the in-depth interview and focus group discussions all concerned officials and/or participants of the Zone and woreda levels were purposively selected. Besides, in collaboration with these concerned officials, returnees and their families were also taken using a snowball sampling technique in

the study areas. In general, a total of 64 returnee migrants, 35 returnee migrant parents, and 50 government officials from different sectors and 16 community elders were selected as informants to provide adequate information on the effect of human trafficking on human security in the study area.

#### 1.6.4. Data Gathering Tools

**Key Informant Interviews (KII):** the interview items were prepared for returnee migrant and administrators, youth and women youth office officials, the office of social affairs and security, and the police officers. The responses of the participants were documented using an audio recorder based on the consent of respondents. Thus, 15 interview questions were set in line with the research questions of the study. Thus, face-to-face interviews were conducted with participants on their practices and experiences of human trafficking and its effect on human security in the Oromia regional state. The interview process was continued until data saturation was secured.

**Focus Group Discussions (FGDs):** was carried out to get further information that may not be addressed by individual respondents through KII. The FGD involved parents of returnee migrants and community elders. The data collected using this technique was important for it can be used as a crosschecking mechanism for the data collected using the interview. In line with this, two Focus group discussions with parents' returnee migrants and with community elders were held. The researchers have used guiding questions to conduct group discussions, and the respondents have given complemented information during the discussion. The researchers led the discussions and captured the views and ideas of each discussion by probing. Focus group discussions were primarily conducted to explore in-depth information, which was recorded using a recorder after getting the respondents' permission. Each group contains six to eight participants where the homogeneity of each group was considered. Each discussion was held for one to one and a half hours with each group.

#### 1.6.5. Procedures of Data Collection

Before proceeding to the actual data gatherings participants were asked to read and agree or disagree with the research participant's consent forms. Based on these forms, they were given to read (those who are unable to read were asked orally) and show their willingness to be audio and video recorded while the interviewing was on progress. After getting their consent from study participants, the researchers conducted interviews and FGDs.

Before data collection the data gathering tools such as in-depth interviews, the content and face validity of the KII and FGD questions were reviewed and assessed by experts in the field and necessary corrections were made. Based on their feedback, vague items were rephrased and merged, and items that were not relevant and unclear were canceled. Therefore,



the trustworthiness, accuracy, and dependability of the data were high. Besides, triangulation is used essentially to ensure that the data collected is accurate.

#### **1.6.6. Data Analysis**

The data obtained from in-depth interviews and FGDs were first edited in the field and coded, although there are no set guidelines for coding data, some general procedures exist (Creswell, 2012 & Dornyei, 2007). The process of segmenting and labeling text to form descriptions and broad themes in the data was done. This coding process aimed to make sense out of text data, divide it into text or image segments, label the segments with codes, examine codes for overlap and redundancy, and collapse these codes into broad themes. In the process, the researchers selected specific data to use and disregard other data that do not specifically provide evidence for the study. Therefore, after the in-depth interviews and FGDs, data were organized thematically and analyzed qualitatively by taking the theme of extracts and/or episodes from the transcribed data of the participants, and the thematic categories of the interview data in line with the specific research questions of the study.

#### **1.6.7. Ethical Considerations**

The following specific actions were taken into account to comply with the do no harm principle of research ethics. The purpose and significance of the research were explained for the research participants briefly and before data collection. Likewise, sufficient information was given to all the participants on the purpose and significance of the study. All participants have been informed of the confidentiality of the information they provided and made them understand that the researchers could be liable not only for the confidentiality of all information but also for bringing out information that could harm the privacy and dignity of participants. Therefore, during the informed consent processes, the researchers explained ways of using information and associated risks due to infringement of confidentiality. Participants in the study were clear on their participation through volunteer and they could decide not to take part at any time and stage, without any hesitation, and they were informed that they would not lose any benefit because of not participating in the research. This helped participants to take part in the research with full confidence and to explain their opinion freely.

## **2. Results and Discussions**

### **2.1. Effects of Human Trafficking on Human Security**

Migrants while migrating through human trafficking at different stages are vulnerable to different human security threats. Migrants are vulnerable to smugglers at different stages of their journey since they cannot travel to different areas without their help. So, at the initial stage smugglers secretly contact potential migrants using their networks. The smugglers without providing clear information about the gravity of the journey and the only means of transport they convince them they will benefit when they go to the destination country. The

smugglers often convince traffickers as if crossing the desert and water journey is not as difficult, they can get a better income, and in a short period as they can solve their economic problems.

An informant from returnee migrant confirmed from her own experience as follows:

*Smuggling is highly vulnerable to illegal activities and smugglers communicate with migrants and sometimes with our parents. The smugglers convince the migrants as the journey is easy and as there is no problem on their way. But in reality, the promises and ideas of the smugglers are quite different. The migrants are exposed to different human security problems.*

As indicated in the above response from the returnee migrant, the smugglers and migrants make contact concerning the journey directly or indirectly. Smugglers are more influential in the study area through their networks up to the local community level. To get money from the migrants they use different mechanisms. Since smugglers are witnessed by the migrants; migrants are under their control. One of the returnees interviewed explains the following:

*When I returned from my journey, my wife has married another man. Psychologically I am not in good condition. I do not want to spend any time with my former friends. There are so many things that I could not tell you now [crying, emotional silence]. These traffickers are inhuman. They do not think of you. They consider you like an animal. They are very much arrogant. They always drink, and intoxicate; they frequently ask money through enforcing us to call via phone to our families.*

From the above informant, it can be uncovered that the person has lost his wife and his health status is under a question mark. He looks like a discriminated person by his former friends, and through time, it is possible to guess that things are going to be complicated. His reaction to the smugglers is the worst feeling, and they did hurt him. Intoxicated traffickers humiliated him.

The effects of trafficking could vary depending on the type of exploitation and situations that they undergo, victims are often affected by physical, sexual, psychological, and social impacts. A returnee participant, in this regard, reacted that:

*One day in our journey, there were three smugglers, and all of them needs a girl among us who seems beautiful and they left us on the bush and went to the other side of the hidden bush with that cute girl. After two or three minutes, we heard her voice shouting, and we do not know what was going on there. After some long minutes, they returned and joined us. As the*

*respondent said, “Her face looks like a tomato”, and we all were frightening them.*

From the above extract, one could say that migrants might have sexually abused her, and/or they might be struggling to harass her. This, in turn, may result in HIV or other transmitted diseases, if they abused her. The other victim confessed, “Sexual harassment is a common practice in the journey. They usually abuse us but if you disagree with their idea, they will beat you physically.” This respondent was telling freely, and it seems that she has adapted the harassment practiced at her. Based on her reaction, it was beyond the normal harassment; having sex with a lady one after the other. Excessive unsafe sex seems a culture in the middle of the journey. Taking this particular case in point, a single woman who passed through human trafficking has experienced not only many worst forms of human violations but also suffered from all the threats to human security.

Likewise, this finding is relatively in line with Frouws (2014) who argued that irregular trans-border migration is extremely unsafe causing high human costs. In line with this, along with the journey, young men and women could be exposed to high risks, from loss of life to injuries, tortures, and kidnapping, to sexual and financial exploitations, grabbing of money and properties, hunger and water thirst (Kassegn and Gashaw, 2017).

Generally, the interview and focus group discussion show that human trafficking has an effect on human security in the study area. Accordingly, a respondent from the Women Association Office said:

*The effects of human trafficking on human security are paramount. The main effects of human trafficking on human security are migrants who are exposed to unsafe sexual abuse by smugglers and sexually transmitted diseases. Besides, in the remote desert areas due to high temperature, shortage of water, food, etc. migrants particularly females die. There are also many cases of mental illness and physical problems.*

In this regard, Gabreil (2017) found that the main participants and/or buyers of trafficked persons include sex tourists, pornography producers, brothel owners, sex customers, and employers of all types who are looking for cheap labor both for domestic and industrial purposes. The central destinations are developed countries in the West, the Middle East, big cities, areas of various conflict zones, military bases, and mining areas in developing countries are the main actors.

Another informant of the study from Social Affairs revealed that:

*The effect of human trafficking is a severe one. Because it is one of the challenges of development since the productive force is migrating. It has also serious effects on human security up to death. In our area, there is no day*

*without hearing death from Saudi-Arabia. Many migrants have died in the destination, and they come to their home place for the funeral ceremony. Many individuals died in this destination and the desert areas during their journey. Surprisingly I remember one day four of them died in Saudi-Arabia from one generation. So, the effects of migration are multidimensional because it has effects on political, economic, and social.*

The above statements indicate that the magnitude of the effects of human trafficking on human security in the study area is a severe one. Human trafficking deteriorates the human security of the migrants. Moreover, a participant from the Jimma Zone (security officer) proved that there are several negative impacts of human trafficking in the area. He added that most of the migrants are not arriving at the destination they dreamed of. These security officers have been hearing lots of sad news daily for a long period when these ambitious job seekers have got sank in seas or oceans while traveling to their destinations. This showed that the area is vulnerable to this kind of consequence.

The result obtained from another participant from Women and Children Affairs uncovered that there are so many negative effects of human trafficking. One of these, as she mentioned, is the impact that victims often suffer from psychological and physical trauma. The head of the office added that even after returning from Arab countries, they are seen becoming abnormal and dizzy as a result of something bad they experienced there. Likewise, according to an officer from justice, most of the problems that the victims encounter is very serious. In addition to those who are directly affected by human trafficking, their families also suffer from economic and moral crises.

Furthermore, another participant from the Police Office from Jimma Zone reported a few impacts of human trafficking. He noted that victims are often abused harshly by their employers upon their arrival to Arab countries. In this regard, it is usually reported as girls or women are continuously raped despite the long hours' service they offer them almost being considered as slaves. On top of this, the officer added that it is often heard as their kidneys are taken out of them and transplanted into someone's kidney if a relative of the employer suffered from kidney disease. This, in turn, confirm that there is nothing truly worst beyond this kind of act.

The data obtained from West Arsi Zone revealed that the effect of human trafficking, another participant clarified, includes loss of life while crossing oversea, physical disability, incarceration, and health problems like mental illness. In the same vein, a prosecutor in the West Arsi Zone further expressed that as a result of human trafficking, the victims are exposed to both physical and mental damage and even lose their life either at a destination or while trafficking due to a lack of awareness about the negative consequences of human trafficking. Most of the returnees of human trafficking develop mental illness when they are unable to meet their initial needs and lack what they initially expected to get. The victims are exposed to physical and mental health problems as the expert witnessed returnees in the area.

A court officer in West Arsi Zone further confirmed that the victims often go abroad in illegal ways. As a result, the employers deny paying salaries of the victims that make these victims come back to their home country with bare hands without securing the money they initially planned to get. This officer added that some victims lose their life while being transported and thrown from buildings down to the ground. They also encounter health problems like mental illness and fistula. Most of the time, victims face wastage of money they sent to families, friends, and other relatives. These problems make the victims be dependent, disabled, and needy social groups.

A participant from Arsi Zone described that the victims of human trafficking face problems like loss of their life on the ways to abroad and even at employment places, sexual harassment, rape, loss of their salaries due to denial of the employers to pay, divorce, physical and mental health problems due to the gap between their initial expectation and what they obtained.

Likewise, a respondent from Jimma Zone affirmed that problems like rape by both the father and son of the employers and other forms of sexual harassment are common in the Arab-World. This participant professed that there are also individual returnees who are thrown from a building, and boiled acid is sprayed or splattered to their body parts.

A security officer from West Arsi Zone reported that human trafficking has many effects on the life of the victims. For instance, due to human trafficking, many of the victims lost their lives; others lose their bodies. They are considered slaves and are unable to decide on their issues and their life often fails at the hands of employers. The victims of human trafficking often lose their humanities because they are transported abroad like the way goods and cattle are transported which has great health impact on the victims and makes the victims lose their lives while crossing oversea. As we see and hear from mass Media, human trafficking also involves removing and selling human body parts like the kidney while transporting.

In line with this, a participant added that while some migrants lose their life on trafficking and at the destination, the majority of the returnees are exposed to mental health problems due to different pressures they encounter from their employers. Despite the families sometimes they face the Cadaver bodies of victims of human trafficking that come from abroad. Others remain disappeared after living their home country; they do not call their family and no one knows where they are found.

The returnee migrants were interviewed to share ideas concerning the effects of human trafficking on human security on different stages and are presented as follows.

## **2.2. Effect of Human Trafficking at the Initial Stage**

Human trafficking leads to the massive negative effect of human security in the study area. The precious effect on individuals, families, and communities are wide-ranging and include impoverishment, social isolation, exclusion from health services, welfare and education provision, access to justice, breakdown of the social relationship, etc. are some of the effects faced up on migrants at different stages of the journey starting from the home country up to destination country.

One of the returnee migrants reflected that:

*When I discussed it with my friends, on human trafficking, we are worried about the economic problems of our parents; however, we force them to give us money for our journey to migrate. Repeatedly, my father inflicts because I could not have any capacity to cover all the expenses of the whole journey to Saudi Arabia. Thus, I enforced my father, repeatedly, to borrow money from his relatives. Besides, I was always fighting with my father and mother. In the end, my father borrowed money from microfinance and gave me ten thousand Eth Birr then I went to Saudi Arabia.*

The study indicates that the issue of migration in the study area has negative effects on human security starting from the initial stage of migration in the home place. In the first place, migrants force their parents to give them money for their journey. If parents refuse their idea, the migrants steal the property of their parents, trying to perform suicide, fighting with family members, sinking into the water, etc. emotional, psychological disturbance and mental instability, and confusion prevails in the family. In addition to this, the economic crisis within the family prevails since some of the parents lend money from their relatives and microfinance institution for their children.

### **2.3. Effects of Human Trafficking During Journey**

The effects of human trafficking on human security also continued in the journey and transit station. The smugglers' promise and convince migrants at the home place are quite different in the journey and transit areas because migrants face many human security problems and suffer in the whole process of the journey, which is the most dangerous, and irritating more than the expectation of migrants. In line with this, Gabriel (2017:3) stated, "Ethiopian women in the Middle East are the subject of serious violence and human rights violations. Their journey, in the majority of the cases, is turning from legally recognized labor migration into a clear case of trafficking."

While migrants traveling through many routes there are various forms of human security problems faced upon migrants. The means of transport they use are public transport and on foot. Most of the time, the journey is at night in dark. Migrants with the help of smugglers travel from Djibouti to Yemen through the sea by boats with different sizes. The



number of migrants per boat is not balanced since in one boat from 90-100 migrants travel oversea. But the normal capacity per boat is 45-50 travelers. As it is out of the capacity of the boat, there is more crowding, there is a high chance to enter water inside the boat, and it may sink. Some returnee migrants also reported that out of public transport they were using other alternative means of transport like truck and Lorries carrying containers. Within the container, irregular migrants travel. Inside the container, there is a shortage of air and crowdedness, as a result, many irregular migrants die. So, while irregular migrants travel through different means of transportation and on foot with the help of smugglers there are many human security problems faced upon irregular migrants to arrive at destination country – Saudi-Arabia.

Regarding the journey, a participant from West Hararge Zone narrated her experience as follows: In their journey, they start their journey to the eastern direction on foot. She added that they travel in the bush forest for so many weeks; many people die, raped, and harassed on the journey. On the journey, as she said, they traveled in the forests for 27 days in Djibouti and Somalia. In the middle of this journey, there was theft and robbery on their way. When smugglers take drugs, they usually kill persons. They usually frightened them using a knife and pistol. To save their lives, they give them all materials they needed.

Besides, a respondent from Jimma Zone replied that she has suffered a lot on her way to Yemeni. Traveling in a long desert by itself is so dangerous. In addition to this, the traffickers asked them money now and then as if they are a machine to produce money. They forced them to give a call to her older sister and her sister sent her lots of money that they (traffickers) asked her to pay. Had it end with this, it was not bad, but they raped her and her friend several times. I felt annoyed when I describe this immoral act. She underlined that she is telling this information in order others learn from her experience. This study shows that Trans-border migration comes with different harassment problems including rape and sexual abuse by smugglers and the risk of sexually transmitted diseases and other security problems.

From the interview and FGD, respondents confirmed, as there was rape by smugglers up on migrants during their journey. Almost all the respondents replied that rape by smugglers has happened during the journey. From this, it is possible to understand that there is the rape of irregular trans-border migration by smugglers while moving to the destination country. The main routes of migration from Ethiopia are through Ethiopia Moyale through Kenya, Djibouti in the eastern direction, and Togo Wuchali direction, and finally via Metema and Sudan in the northern Ethiopian direction are the four main routes. These countries are Middle East, South Africa, and Sudan, and to the route of Libya to Italy are the major destination countries.

The majority of the respondents responded that inhuman treatment has happened during the journey. Regarding human rights violations, the respondents are of the view that there are human rights violations. They revealed that there are thirsty and hunger during the journey of the desert and sea. The interview shows all of the respondents agree that there are thirsty and hunger during their way to the destination country.

One of the informants from returnee irregular migrants during the interview mentioned that:

*In my journey, many human security problems were faced up on me including insulting, torching, and beating. In addition to this, there was also thirsty, hunger, and not allowing holding mobile, not stopping the journey until the smugglers allow stopping. Most of the journey was on foot at night. Females and fatty males because of the long journey on foot and hunger and thirsty died. Some of them also emotionally and psychologically disturbed. There is also a much dead body that has been seen in the desert area. After thirty days of the journey on foot, we arrived at the area called Legaassen of the Djibouti border. I have seen sexual harassment by smugglers from Yemen up on beautiful and young female migrants. Even when they cry no one helps them because every irregular migrant knows the consequences if they try to oppose or help the victims. Smugglers also do not consider individuals as humans but they worry about their business. There is also forced payment out of the capacity of parents and irregular migrants. Furthermore, the inhuman treatment also happens throughout the journey.*

From this, it can be understood that smugglers exercise absolute power in full filing their unlimited want. Consequently, migrants cannot protect themselves from different inhuman treatments while moving to Saudi Arabia through the dangerous desert and sea journey. So, it is clearly understood that migrants are exposed to different human security problems including physical violence, psychological disturbance, sexual harassment, and emotional problems.

Besides, another informant from the returnee migrant revealed that:

*In general, there are various gross violations of human rights. No one can take measures on those individuals who violate the rights of migrants. The traffickers and gangsters are above the law; no one can ask them. The life of the migrants is up on the smugglers and gangsters. In addition to this, on the journey, there was biting by snakes and other animals in the middle of the desert. For this problem, there is no treatment; as a result, our friend died because of snake biting. I have also seen migrants were transported within containers as materials due to this, many migrants died and killing individuals who tried to oppose the smugglers' idea is a common tradition. So, you have to simply accept everything they order you. Sea smugglers, if anyone performs any activity out of their permission, sometimes they throw them on the sea. There was also repeated torching upon migrants, which result in impairment, hearing impairment, and other physical problems. Therefore, human trafficking results in many security problems from insulting in, and health problems up to the death of life.*

As the above episode reveals, migrants have coerced everything that smugglers ordered them to do so. One can easily imagine the scene of the incident, embezzlement, loaded labor, and sexual harassment happened there. The illegal traffickers and employers in the destination countries direct everything. Despite every migrant who is ready, to go in the home country has had this information, still thousands and millions seem ready to go again. Thus, it is clear that the destination country is selected since the existing realities in the home country are not good.

Besides, the study participants responded that migrants are financially exploited during the movement to the destination countries. So, all of the respondents agreed that there is financial exploitation imposed by smugglers and requested by different gangsters and other individuals. The interview result also shows that there is financial exploitation in the desert journey by some security forces, gangsters, and smugglers. There are many station areas; in these areas, where migrants are requested to pay some amount of money. If the migrants are refused to pay them insulting, physical punishment, interruption of the journey is a common practice. There is no alternative; it is only paying the requested amount of money.

Moreover, a returnee participant from East Hararge zone expressed that:

*One day, I do remember when a smuggler was insulting and beating all of us. It was a horrible journey, due to this; I blamed myself for the illegal journey that I had started. A person was insulting all of us because we were very much tired, and we could not walk properly. Through time, we slowed our speed of walk. Then he became angry because he wanted to pass some areas and other smugglers who would continue the next journey, they considered bad, before the sun rises but we could not. As a result, they insulted us and these people beat some of my friends. In the middle of the journey, I was highly thirsty for water. I asked one of the smugglers, who looked very much strong and full of confused, angered, and starved person to give me water. He spits out on my face. Finally, since we could not pass that place, we were allowed to place ourselves in a hidden place somewhere in the middle of bushes, full of sand place. That was the worst time ever I do not want to remember.*

The above extract tells us beyond what the participant told us. The place looked very much deserted and full of sand that they could not get water. Access to water, food, and other issues is unthinkable. Physically these smugglers beat these illegal migrants. They experience something new beyond what they expect in their journey. Unable to walk properly and pass the places they need to skip the area from police resulted in punishment. The punishment, as observed from some photographs in West Hararge Zone police officer, was disgraceful and horrible.

Illegal migrants usually in their stay serve brokers by washing their clothes and various household activities and other forms of exploitation. A participant reacted that beyond being a servant for the brokers, organ removal is the most common trend. Concerning this, a participant from East Hararge confirmed that:

*Brokers were about to remove my kidney through surgery with a medical person (I think) in the center of the town where they hide me. I heard when they gossip about the issue of my kidney's surgery, and I asked to go to the toilet and I went out, and I reported to the police. Then the police officers requested me to show them, but they were not at their home.*

At the zonal level, there is peer pressure triggered by people who are living in abroad, particularly in Europe and neighbors who returned from abroad, probably among some who started little business in their hometown. People who live in Europe post photographs in social media being in front of a car and villa house. As a result, youths in the home country would be easily motivated to flee.

By way of indicating the gap in combating human trafficking a respondent from the East Hararge Zone Women's Affairs recommended awareness training be given through taking those victims as an example, the society would have been changed. People compete with each other by sending their daughters and sons to the Middle East and South Africa, mainly. The respondent also reacted to how trafficking is engulfing the youth.

*In our zone, many youths are health victims. Some are mentally retarded, and some others are psychologically harmed. Besides, HIV is a common disease among those returnee migrants. The preponderances of them are not interested to share and talk ideas with people. People are pointing their fingers with returnees. This, in turn, hurts and increases their mental and psychological health.*

The extract above depicted that there are serious effects on the human security of returnees and there are people who are harmed. During interviews and FGDs, the health statuses of some respondents were not good. Some of them were unable to express their opinions freely regardless of their prior condition; they seem mentally hurt. The preponderance respondents described that there are various health damages these returnees are encountering both in their journey and at the destination places. Moreover, the result uncovered that these returnees are unable to pay back the money they borrowed, and they are very much stressed in many aspects.

#### **2.4. Effects of Human Trafficking at the Destination**

Migrants reported that after passing the dangerous and risky journey through desert and sea, they would arrive at their destination countries. Migrants were exposed to human security problems in the destination country as well. The information they get from smugglers at the very beginning was different in the destination country.

With this, an FGD participant from Jimma Zone said that the migrants' family often expects money from migrants and the society defames migrants who returned from Arab countries without saving enough amount of money. For instance, as she said, her friend who returned home was in a problem with her father as she was not able to pay back the money that she spent on her travel. As a result, she was totally in stressful and bad health conditions. Subsequently, she got seriously sick and died.

Regarding social service discrimination, migrants replied that there is social service discrimination upon migrants. The result gained from the interview and FGD showed that there is a major problem of social service discrimination upon migrants. In line with this, one of the respondents from returnee migrant affirmed that:

*Getting different social services in Saudi-Arabia is based on discrimination. Migrants are discriminated against in getting treatment in public health centers like that of citizens of Saudi-Arabia. We migrants can go to public health centers but security forces can return us to our country. We have only to go to the private clinic; however, they offer more money which we cannot afford. Besides, there is no freedom of movement from place to place and using legal transports. We are only using illegal transport to move from place to place. In general, there are many problems with using social services. For example, one day two of my friends were fighting each other, one of them was injured on his head and has more hemorrhage. At that time, we couldn't get transport to take him to the health center. As a result, he takes a long hour and he died because of his bleeding.*

Looking at this, in line with the findings, it is possibly understandable to imagine that migrants are discriminated against in getting treatment in public health centers like that of citizens of Saudi-Arabia. There is social service discrimination like using public health centers, getting justice, and using public transport. This implies that the issue of social service discrimination is extremely inhuman and violation of human rights is highly practiced. Currently, many communicable and non-communicable diseases need early diagnosis and treatment. In line with getting health care treatment equal accessibility of transport and justice in the daily activities of migrants is a very significant concern of saving the life of any individual as a human being.

The subsequent violence of basic human rights, death, and taking away property were often caused by human trafficking and departure over their rights. If there are violations of human rights, deprivations of human needs there are always human insecurities. From the study, it is understandable that the migrants at the destination countries faced human security problems. Among these problems, sexual harassment and rapping of Ethiopian servants by husband and son are often common experiences.

One of the interviewees confirmed that “Situations promised by smugglers and real situations at the destination countries are quite different. At the destination countries upon migrants, there is a gross violation of rights like human rights violations, physical violence, injuring bodies, forcing to work for a long hour, denying salary, etc.”

Therefore, it is possible to expect that the legal protection of human security in Saudi Arabia is extremely low. This can be indicated by discrimination on respecting the rights of migrants as a human being; lack of guarantee for security from security forces of the destination countries, abusive treatment, considering as a slave, and the absence of a law that protects the right of migrants. Moreover, workers cannot escape from abusive conditions as they are not even allowed to return their home country upon completion of their contracts unless the employers permitted them to leave the host country.

In addition to this, the interview result shows that there is the death of migrants in the study area. Consistent with this result, the interview also proved that “We faced discrimination of social service, sexual harassment, throwing down of migrants from a building. In general, many human security problems reach up to the loss of life.”

According to the IOM and IGAD (2015) report, Ethiopia is a source and, to a lesser extent, destination and transit country for men, women, and children subjected to forced labor and sex trafficking. In this regard, Peulić (2017) supports this idea saying trafficking emerges in different forms, the most discernible of which are forced labor and sexual exploitation that is among the hardest forms of desecrating human soul. Unfortunately, it is a common phenomenon that many people (some independent estimates mention a figure of several million) around the world, women, and children, in particular, every year become victims of this violence. Tough living conditions, as well as uncertain economic futures, are among fundamental causes infecting a healthy society. If a well-organized criminal network or a ‘hidden economy’ succeeds to impose the rule of conduct, then human trafficking finds fertile soil in which to grow. Having been lured the victims later realize where they are, but many *never* return to their families, and that terrible fate should make society do what can be done and help them. Migrants are smuggled and trafficked through the country via three major routes in the east, north, and south.

### 3. Conclusions and Implications



Human trafficking leads to many human security effects at the individual, community, and country levels. Due to push-pull factors, migrants enter into dangerous and full of risk for their human security, and the youth migrants face many human security problems including death, health problems, inhuman treatment, a gross violation of human rights, and discrimination in using social service. Besides, the migration may not be successful always, and then parents cannot get money for paying what they have borrowed from their relatives or neighbors. As a result, the families enter to more severe poverty and economic crises than ever before. From this, it is possible to conclude that economic crises, many human security problems will prevail among the family including distress, confusion, conflict, disintegration, and divorce. Thus, as human trafficking negatively affects the human security of the migrants it needs a concerted effort of all concerned bodies and searching for a source of income in the home country to minimize the current human trafficking in the study area.

Since human trafficking transcends state boundaries, it would be difficult to overcome the problem through sporadic efforts by individual countries or nations. Hence there is a need for concerted efforts to be put in place by these governments. Thus, different national, regional, and international organizations such as AU, the Arab League, EU, and the UN including the financial institutions such as IMF and the World Bank to get together and plan and support youth job creation activities in their home countries to curb the problem of human trafficking.

#### 4. References

- Animaw Anteneh (2011). *Trafficking in Persons Overseas for Labor Purposes: The case of Ethiopian domestic workers*, ILO CO Addis Ababa. A research conducted by Play Therapy Ethiopia.
- Bahar Jibriel (2014). A Human Rights-Based Approach to Counteract Trafficking in Women: The Case of Ethiopia. *Oromia Law Journal*. Vol 3, No. 1.pp. 212-259.
- Cameroon, S., and E. Newman. (2008). Introduction: Understanding human Trafficking. In *Trafficking in Humans: Social, Cultural, and Political Dimensions*, Hong Kong: United Nations University Press.
- Creswell, J. (2012). *Educational Research: Planning, Conducting, and Evaluating Qualitative and Quantitative Research*. Boston: Pearson Education Inc.
- Dornyei, Z. (2007). *Research Methods in Applied Linguistics: Quantitative, Qualitative, and Mixed Methodologies*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Endalew, A. (2014). International Migration in Ethiopia: Challenges and Opportunities. In A. Bariagaber, *International Migration and Development in Eastern and Southern Africa*. Addis Ababa: Organization for Social Science Research in Eastern and Southern Africa (OSSREA).

Estevens, J. (2018). Migration crisis in the EU: Developing a framework for the analysis of national security and defense strategies. *Comparative Migration Studies*. 6(1): 28.

Friesendorf, C. (2009). Strategies Against Human Trafficking: The Role of the Security Sector. Vienna: Study Group Information.

Frouws, B. (2014). Going West: contemporary mixed migration trends from the Horn of Africa to Libya & Europe. Kenya: Regional Mixed Migration Secretary (RMMS)/ Danish Refugee Council.

Gebriel Temesgen. (2012). The root causes and solutions to human trafficking in Ethiopia. Adigrat University, Adigrat, Ethiopia.

Gudetu Wakgari. (2014). Causes and Consequences of Human Trafficking in Ethiopia: The case of Women in the Middle East. *International Journal of Gender and Women's Studies*, 2 (2): 233-246.

ILO (2008). Action against Trafficking in Human beings Switzerland Geneva, Retrieved on September 12, 2019.

ILO (2010). International labor migration. A rights-based approach. Geneva: ILO.

ILO (2014). ILO's 2014 Fair Migration Agenda. Geneva: ILO.

ILO (2017). Promote Effective Labor Migration Governance in Ethiopia: Program Achievements, International Labor Office. ISBN: 978-92-2-131014-3.

IMF (2013). Emigration and Its Economic Impact on Eastern Europe. IMF Staff Discussion Note. IMF.

IOM (2008). East Africa Migration Route Initiative Gaps & Needs Analysis Project Country Reports: Ethiopia, Kenya, Libya. Vienna: ICMPD.

IOM (2019). Migrants and their Vulnerability. Geneva: IOM.

IOM (2009). Migration, Environment, and Climate Change: Assessing the Evidence Pretoria: International Organization for Migration.

IOM (2017). World Migration Report 2018, International Migration Agency, Geneva Switzerland, Accessed on May 21, 2019

IOM (2006). Breaking the cycle of vulnerability responding to the health's needs of trafficked women in East and southern Africa. (PP. 21-43) Pretoria: International Organization for Migration.

Kassegne Damtew and Gashaw Mohamed (2017). Magnitude, determinants, and effects of illegal out-migration from South Wollo Zone: the cases of Ambassel, Tehuledere, and Worebabo woredas.

Malinowski, R. L. (2015). Irregular Cross-border Migration and Security: The Case of Kenya-Somalia and Kenya-Ethiopia Borders. *Occasional Paper*, 4.

Mehari Tadelle ( 2019). In-depth: Unpacking Ethiopia's revised refugee law. *Africa Portal*.

Ministry of Foreign Affairs (2014). The situation causes and recommendations to eliminate human trafficking and smuggling in Ethiopia, Paper presented on Irregular Migration to the Ethiopian National Discussion Forum.

Marinova, N.K, Nadejda K., and James.P. ( 2012). The Tragedy of Human Trafficking: Competing Theories and European Evidence. *Foreign Policy Analysis* Vol. 8, No. 3. pp. 231-253.

Nicola J. E. (2014). Re-thinking girls on the move: The intersection of poverty, exploitation, and violence experienced by Ethiopian adolescents involved in the Middle East “maid trade”. London: Overseas Development Institute.

OHCHR (2002). Migration and human rights: Improving Human Rights-Based Governance of International Migration. UN Human Rights Office.

Petit, R. (2014). Human Trafficking: An Issue of Human and National Security: University of Miami Law School Institutional Repository University of Miami National Security & Armed Conflict Law Review.

Peulić, K. (2017). Human trafficking: a threat to state security and human security, *Bezbjednost, policija, građani*, 13(1), 69–79.

Selamawit Bekele. (2013). The vulnerability of Ethiopian Women and Girls: the Case of Domestic Workers in Saudi Arabia and Kuwait. MA Dissertation Submitted to the Department of Sociology, Uppsala Universitet, Sweden.<http://uu.diva-portal.org/smash/get/diva2:624613/FULLTEXT01.pdf> UNHR, 2014.

UNHCR.(2014). Smuggling and Trafficking from the East and Horn of Africa. Geneva: UNHCR.

UNIDOC (2011). Smuggling of Migrants - A Global Review and Annotated Bibliography of Recent Publications. New York: United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime.

UNODC (2008). An Introduction to Human Trafficking: Vulnerability, Impact, and Action. Geneva: UNODC.

USD (2016). Trafficking in Persons Report, Washington, DC: US Department of State. Retrieved June 2017 from <https://www.state.gov/documents/organization/243562.pdf>.

UNODC (2009). COMBATING TRAFFICKING IN PERSONS A Handbook for Parliamentarians. A HANDBOOK FOR PARLIAMENTARIANS N° 16. Inter-Parliamentary Union and UNODC.

USD (2014). Trafficking in Persons Report 2014. Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons.

Wondu Teshome and Ephrem Belete (2017). The Causes of Rural to Urban Migrations in the Case of Dire Dawa City Administration, Eastern Ethiopia. *Research on Humanities and Social Sciences*. Vol.7 No.23.

World Bank Group. 2015. Ethiopia Poverty Assessment 2014. Washington, D.C. © World Bank. <https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/handle/10986/21323> License: CC by 3.0 IGO.